# Can the impact of grey literature be assessed? An investigation of UK government publications cited by articles and books 

Matthew S. Bickley ${ }^{1}$, Kayvan Kousha ${ }^{2}$ and Michael Thelwall ${ }^{3}$<br>${ }^{1}$ M.Bickley@wlv.ac.uk<br>${ }^{2}$ K.Kousha@wlv.ac.uk<br>${ }^{3}$ M.Thelwall@wlv.ac.uk<br>${ }^{1,2,3}$ Statistical Cybermetrics Research Group (SCRG), University of Wolverhampton, Wulfruna Street, Wolverhampton, WV1 1LY (United Kingdom)

## Appendices

## Appendix 1

Table 1 All 47 policy areas as defined on www.gov.uk/government/publications, split by years used, with total over all years in repository (1945-2018, Policy areas sorted alphabetically)

| Policy area | $\begin{gathered} \hline \text { All } \\ \text { years } \\ (1945- \\ 2018) \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | 2013 | 2014 | 2015 | 2016 | 2017 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Arts and culture | 911 | 76 | 69 | 111 | 83 | 95 |
| Borders and immigration | 2876 | 331 | 498 | 339 | 338 | 413 |
| Business and enterprise | 8283 | 477 | 1735 | 1147 | 1291 | 1496 |
| Children and young people | 2697 | 217 | 426 | 381 | 405 | 331 |
| Climate change | 2982 | 517 | 486 | 390 | 285 | 294 |
| Community and society | 3166 | 281 | 424 | 586 | 487 | 479 |
| Consumer rights and issues | 681 | 65 | 73 | 52 | 46 | 66 |
| Crime and policing | 3648 | 286 | 759 | 691 | 525 | 625 |
| Defence and armed forces | 3647 | 216 | 576 | 535 | 635 | 649 |
| Employment | 3438 | 314 | 712 | 503 | 374 | 354 |
| Energy | 4161 | 492 | 662 | 681 | 530 | 541 |
| Environment | 7945 | 681 | 1054 | 1077 | 1195 | 1158 |
| Equality, rights and citizenship | 1337 | 111 | 115 | 192 | 89 | 80 |
| Europe | 411 | 29 | 53 | 41 | 55 | 75 |
| Financial services | 357 | 27 | 84 | 76 | 52 | 71 |
| Food and farming | 2603 | 204 | 499 | 532 | 353 | 436 |
| Foreign affairs | 2446 | 246 | 256 | 527 | 265 | 364 |
| Further education and skills | 2269 | 106 | 240 | 347 | 498 | 488 |
| Government efficiency, transparency and accountability | 12628 | 1089 | 2321 | 1909 | 1595 | 1933 |
| Government spending | 1192 | 129 | 191 | 134 | 135 | 172 |
| Higher education | 502 | 38 | 67 | 79 | 97 | 92 |
| Housing | 2834 | 167 | 641 | 499 | 393 | 607 |
| International aid and development | 2571 | 456 | 329 | 306 | 201 | 199 |
| Law and the justice system | 4118 | 318 | 697 | 561 | 619 | 651 |
| Local government | 1929 | 272 | 257 | 210 | 158 | 183 |
| Media and communications | 702 | 56 | 58 | 52 | 86 | 94 |
| National Health Service | 5406 | 387 | 769 | 1027 | 1219 | 947 |
| National security | 1029 | 107 | 143 | 113 | 99 | 121 |
| Northern Ireland | 1362 | 38 | 94 | 319 | 299 | 339 |
| Pensions and ageing society | 586 | 65 | 92 | 91 | 63 | 65 |
| Planning and building | 1955 | 256 | 317 | 198 | 241 | 382 |
| Public health | 5170 | 392 | 660 | 728 | 807 | 1293 |
| Public safety and emergencies | 1565 | 169 | 133 | 130 | 150 | 221 |
| Regulation reform | 594 | 72 | 160 | 38 | 31 | 64 |
| Rural and countryside | 909 | 62 | 129 | 169 | 144 | 157 |
| Schools | 5326 | 453 | 864 | 869 | 902 | 905 |
| Science and innovation | 1771 | 161 | 317 | 220 | 288 | 242 |
| Scotland | 555 | 22 | 55 | 113 | 166 | 137 |
| Social care | 1038 | 113 | 106 | 155 | 130 | 103 |
| Sports and leisure | 565 | 65 | 48 | 47 | 33 | 77 |
| Tax and revenue | 6393 | 582 | 1295 | 856 | 1046 | 1236 |
| Trade and investment | 1719 | 234 | 301 | 274 | 195 | 273 |
| Transport | 8098 | 858 | 1070 | 1069 | 940 | 1357 |
| UK economy | 7734 | 712 | 1246 | 1431 | 1197 | 1521 |
| Wales | 1576 | 7 | 209 | 470 | 435 | 352 |
| Welfare | 2309 | 255 | 370 | 302 | 291 | 323 |
| Wildlife and animal welfare | 1565 | 127 | 389 | 210 | 198 | 251 |
| Total | 137559 | 12338 | 22049 | 20787 | 19664 | 22312 |

## Appendix 2

Table 2 Top 5 most cited articles within each GL area as found by Scopus references, sorted by number of citations within GL area (policy areas defined as in the repository)

| Title (in bold) <br> URL (preceded by gov.uk/government/) | Year | Policy area | $G L$ area | Scopus citations |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Housing publications/housing | 2016 | Tax and revenue | Economics | 472 |
| Costs in disputed applications (PG38) publications/costs | 2017 | Business and enterprise | Economics | 259 |
| Sustainability publications/sustainability | 2013 | Tax and revenue | Economics | 112 |
| Facts and figures statistics/facts-and-figures | 2014 | Business and enterprise | Economics | 45 |
| Websites publications/websites | 2014 | UK economy | Economics | 44 |
| SEND code of practice: 0 to 25 years publications/send-code-of-practice-0-to-25 | 2015 | Schools | Education | 40 |
| National curriculum in England: computing programmes of study publications/national-curriculum-in-england-computing-programmes-of-study | 2013 | Schools | Education | 34 |
| National curriculum in England: science programmes of study publications/national-curriculum-in-england-science-programmes-of-study | 2015 | Schools | Education | 30 |
| National curriculum in England: framework for key stages 1 to 4 <br> publications/national-curriculum-in-england- <br> framework-for-key-stages-1-to-4 | 2014 | Schools | Education | 27 |
| National curriculum in England: English programmes of study publications/national-curriculum-in-england-english-programmes-of-study | 2014 | Schools | Education | 25 |
| Climate change publications/climate-change | 2017 | Environment; Food and farming; Wildlife and animal welfare | Environment | 333 |
| Energy consumption in the UK statistics/energy-consumption-in-the-uk | 2017 | Climate change | Environment | 49 |
| Registration, Evaluation and Authorisation of Chemicals (REACH) <br> publications/reach | 2014 | Environment | Environment | 37 |
| Greenhouse gas reporting - Conversion factors 2016 <br> publications/greenhouse-gas-reporting-conversion-factors-2016 | 2016 | Climate change; Environment | Environment | 20 |
| The Carbon Plan - reducing greenhouse gas emissions <br> publications/the-carbon-plan-reducing-greenhouse-gas-emissions--2 | 2013 | Climate change | Environment | 14 |
| Bridges publications/bridges | 2015 | Government efficiency, transparency and accountability | Government | 129 |
| Staffing publications/staffing | 2017 | Government efficiency, transparency and accountability | Government | 72 |

## Open Data Charter <br> publications/open-data-charter

Introducing registers
publications/registers

## Government Digital Strategy

publications/government-digital-strategy

NHS reference costs 2012 to 2013
publications/nhs-reference-costs-2012-to-2013
NHS reference costs 2014 to 2015
publications/nhs-reference-costs-2014-to-2015
NHS reference costs 2013 to 2014
publications/nhs-reference-costs-2013-to-2014
NHS Constitution for England
publications/the-nhs-constitution-for-england
E-cigarettes: an evidence update
publications/e-cigarettes-an-evidence-update
Costs in disputed applications (PG38)
publications/costs
Websites
publications/websites
Spending Review and Autumn Statement 2015: documents
publications/spending-review-and-autumn-statement-2015-documents
Community Energy Strategy
publications/community-energy-strategy
National Travel Survey: 2014
statistics/national-travel-survey-2014
Mental health and travelling abroad
publications/mental-health
Social media
publications/social-media
Chemical weapon use by Syrian regime: UK government legal position
publications/chemical-weapon-use-by-syrian-
regime-uk-government-legal-position
Prevent duty guidance
publications/prevent-duty-guidance
Immigration Act 2014: appeals
publications/appeals
Creative Industries Economic Estimates - January
2015
statistics/creative-industries-economic-estimates-january-2015
Culture White Paper
publications/culture-white-paper
Quantifying and Valuing the Wellbeing Impacts of Culture and Sport
publications/quantifying-and-valuing-the-wellbeing-impacts-of-culture-and-sport
2010 to 2015 government policy: museums and galleries
publications/2010-to-2015-government-policy-museums-and-galleries

2013
accountability Government efficiency, transparency and accountability efficiency, transparency and accountability

Housing

Foreign affairs/
International aid
and development

| Foreign affairs | International <br> affairs | 11 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Borders and <br> immigration <br> Arts and culture | International <br> affairs <br> Leisure | 9 |
|  | 6 |  |

Arts and culture
Leisure
4

Arts and culture/
Leisure
4
Sports and leisure

Arts and culture
Leisure

| London 2012 Games Maker survey publications/london-2012-games-maker-survey | 2013 | Sports and leisure | Leisure | 3 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Energy consumption in the UK <br> statistics/energy-consumption-in-the-uk | 2017 | Energy | Science | 50 |
| Snapshot - UK Science \& Innovation Network newsletter for Europe publications/snapshot | 2015 | Science and innovation | Science | 28 |
| Greenhouse gas reporting - Conversion factors 2016 <br> publications/greenhouse-gas-reporting-conversion-factors-2016 | 2016 | Energy | Science | 20 |
| Performance of the UK research base: international comparison - 2013 <br> publications/performance-of-the-uk-research-base-international-comparison-2013 | 2013 | Science and innovation | Science | 14 |
| The Carbon Plan - reducing greenhouse gas emissions <br> publications/the-carbon-plan-reducing-greenhouse-gas-emissions--2 | 2013 | Energy | Science | 14 |
| Prisoners' criminal backgrounds and proven reoffending after release publications/2012 | 2013 | Crime and policing | Security | 3933 |
| Registration, Evaluation and Authorisation of Chemicals (REACH) <br> publications/reach | 2014 | Defence and armed forces | Security | 37 |
| Prison population figures: 2013 statistics/prison-population-figures | 2014 | Crime and policing/ Law and the justice system | Security | 37 |
| Prison population figures: 2015 statistics/prison-population-figures-2015 | 2016 | Law and the justice system | Security | 16 |
| Circular 003/2013: new government domestic violence and abuse definition publications/new-government-domestic-violence-and-abuse-definition | 2013 | Crime and policing | Security | 13 |
| English indices of deprivation 2015 statistics/english-indices-of-deprivation-2015 | 2015 | Community and society | Society | 121 |
| NDNS: results from Years 1 to 4 (combined) statistics/national-diet-and-nutrition-survey-results-from-years-1-to-4-combined-of-the-rolling-programme-for-2008-and-2009-to-2011-and-2012 | 2017 | Children and young people | Society | 45 |
| SEND code of practice: 0 to 25 years publications/send-code-of-practice-0-to-25 | 2015 | Children and young people | Society | 40 |
| Report of the Mid Staffordshire NHS Foundation Trust Public Inquiry publications/report-of-the-mid-staffordshire-nhs-foundation-trust-public-inquiry | 2013 | Equality, rights and citizenship | Society | 28 |
| Meningococcal B vaccine: JCVI position statement <br> publications/meningococcal-b-vaccine-jcvi-positionstatement | 2014 | Children and young people | Society | 23 |

## Appendix 3



Fig. 1 Proportion of UK government publications in 2013 with at least one citation in Scopus or Google Books with $95 \%$ confidence interval across 47 areas (Sorted by largest Scopus cited)

## Appendix 4



Fig. 2 Proportion of UK government publications in 2014 with at least one citation in Scopus or Google Books with $95 \%$ confidence interval across 47 areas (Sorted by largest Scopus cited)

Appendix 5


Fig. 3 Proportion of UK government publications in 2015 with at least one citation in Scopus or Google Books with $95 \%$ confidence interval across 47 areas (Sorted by largest Scopus cited)

## Appendix 6



Fig. 4 Proportion of UK government publications in 2016 with at least one citation in Scopus or Google Books with $95 \%$ confidence interval across 47 areas (Sorted by largest Scopus cited)

## Appendix 7



Fig. 5 Proportion of UK government publications in 2017 with at least one citation in Scopus or Google Books with $95 \%$ confidence interval across 47 areas (Sorted by largest Scopus cited)

