**How economic crises affect political representation:**

**declining party-voter congruence in times of constrained government**

Denise Traber, Nathalie Giger, Silja Häusermann

**APPENDIX**

**Overview**

[**Appendix A: Notes**](#_Appendix_A:_Notes)

[**Appendix B: Data and coding**](#_Appendix_B:_Data)

[**Appendix C: Figures**](#_Appendix_C:_Figures)

[**Appendix D: Robustness Tests**](#_Appendix_D:_Robustness)

# Appendix A: Notes

*Note N1: Question wording:*

The exact question format in the CSES II is the following: What do you think has been the most important issue facing [country] over the last [number of years that the last government was in office] years? In CSES III we rely on the socio-tropic version again which has a very similar wording than in CSES II (variable C3002\_1).

For the Portuguese elections 2009 we exceptionally use the ego-centric version of the MIP question as the coding of the socio-tropic version is flawed. For the additional election studies we always relied on an open-ended MIP question and where possible on a socio-tropic question format (most important topic for the country).

*Note N2: Recoding of CMP-categories into subcategories of ‘economy’*

‘Pro-market’-statements include the following categories: Free market economy (per401) and Incentives (per402); ‘Pro-state’- statements include the following categories: Market regulation (per403), Economic planning (per404), Keynesian demand management (per409), Controlled economy (per412), Nationalisation (per413) and Marxist Analysis (per415). ‘General economic goals’ are, according to the CMP-Codebook ‘general economic statements that fail to include any specific goal’ (<https://manifesto-project.wzb.eu/coding_schemes/mp_v5>).

# Appendix B: Data and coding

*Table B1: Election Studies*

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | *Country* | *Election year* | *Source* |
| 1 | Canada | 2004 | CSES 2 |
| 2 | Canada | 2008 | CSES 3 |
| 3 | Canada | 2011 | CES 2011 |
| 4 | Denmark | 2001 | CSES 2 |
| 5 | Denmark | 2007 | CSES 3 |
| 6 | Denmark | 2011 | DANES 2011 |
| 7 | Finland | 2003 | CSES 2 |
| 8 | Finland | 2007 | CSES 3 |
| 9 | Finland | 2011 | CSES 3 |
| 10 | France | 2002 | CSES 2 |
| 11 | France | 2007 | CSES 3 |
| 12 | France | 2012 | FES 2012 |
| 13 | Germany | 2002 | CSES 2 |
| 14 | Germany | 2005 | CSES 3 |
| 15 | Germany | 2009 | CSES 3 |
| 16 | Germany | 2013 | GLES 2013 |
| 17 | Great Britain | 2005 | CSES 2 |
| 18 | Great Britain | 2010 | BES 2010 |
| 19 | Iceland | 2003 | CSES 2 |
| 20 | Iceland | 2007 | CSES 3 |
| 21 | Iceland | 2009 | CSES 3 |
| 22 | Ireland | 2002 | CSES 2 |
| 23 | Ireland | 2007 | INES 2002-2007 |
| 24 | Ireland | 2011 | INES 2011 |
| 25 | Italy | 2006 | CSES 2 |
| 26 | Italy | 2008 | ITANES 2008 |
| 27 | Italy | 2013 | ITANES 2013 |
| 28 | Netherlands | 2002 | CSES 2 |
| 29 | Netherlands | 2006 | CSES 3 |
| 30 | Netherlands | 2010 | CSES 3 |
| 31 | Norway | 2001 | CSES 2 |
| 32 | Norway | 2005 | CSES 3 |
| 33 | Norway | 2009 | CSES 3 |
| 34 | Portugal | 2002 | CSES 2 |
| 35 | Portugal | 2005 | CSES 2 |
| 36 | Portugal | 2009 | CSES 3 |
| 37 | Spain | 2004 | CSES2 |
| 38 | Spain | 2008 | CSES3 |
| 39 | Spain | 2011 | National election study |
| 40 | Sweden | 2002 | CSES 2 |
| 41 | Sweden | 2006 | CSES 3 |
| 42 | Sweden | 2010 | SES 2006-2010 |
| 43 | Switzerland | 2003 | CSES 2 |
| 44 | Switzerland | 2007 | CSES 3 |
| 45 | Switzerland | 2011 | Selects 2011 |
| 46 | USA | 2004 | CSES2 |
| 47 | USA | 2008 | CSES3 |
| 48 | USA | 2012 | ANES2012 |

*Table B2: Details of the coding of categories*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | *CMP categories* | *Voter Studies* |
| Economy | Free Enterprise, Incentives, Market Regulation, Economic Planning, Corporatism, Protectionism, Economic Goals, Keynesian Demand Management, Economic growth, Technology and Infrastructure, Controlled Economy, Nationalisation, Economic Orthodoxy, Marxist Analysis  -> Sum of (per 401-per416) | Growth, taxes, deficit, economic crisis, fear of economic downturn,  unemployment |
| Social policy | Equality: positive, Welfare State Expansion, Welfare State Limitation  -> Sum of (per503-per505) | Pension politics, unemployment insurance, social insurance, social inequality |
| Immigration | National Way of Life and Multiculturalism (positive and negative)  -> per601+per602+per607+per608 | Asylum, immigration, xenophobia |
| Security | Law and Order, Military (positive and negative)  -> per605+per104+per105 | National security, law and order, crime |

Note: the full CMP category scheme can be found here: <https://manifesto-project.wzb.eu/coding_schemes/mp_v5>

*Table B3: List of Parties*

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | *Country* | *Election year* | *Party* | *Status* | *New Party* | | *Merger* | |
| 1 | Canada | 2004 | BQ Quebec Bloc | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 2 | Canada | 2004 | CP Conservative Party of Canada | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 1 | 1 | |
| 3 | Canada | 2004 | LP Liberal Party of Canada | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 4 | Canada | 2004 | NDP New Democratic Party | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 5 | Canada | 2008 | BQ Quebec Bloc | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 6 | Canada | 2008 | CP Conservative Party of Canada | current government | 1 | 1 | |
| 7 | Canada | 2008 | Green Party | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 8 | Canada | 2008 | LP Liberal Party of Canada | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 9 | Canada | 2008 | NDP New Democratic Party | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 10 | Canada | 2011 | BQ Quebec Bloc | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 11 | Canada | 2011 | CP Conservative Party of Canada | current government | 1 | 1 | |
| 12 | Canada | 2011 | Green Party | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 13 | Canada | 2011 | LP Liberal Party of Canada | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 14 | Canada | 2011 | NDP New Democratic Party | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 15 | Denmark | 2001 | DF Danish People’s Party | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 16 | Denmark | 2001 | EL Red-Green Unity List | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 17 | Denmark | 2001 | KF Conservative People’s Party | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 18 | Denmark | 2001 | KrF Christian People’s Party | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 19 | Denmark | 2001 | RV Radical Party | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 20 | Denmark | 2001 | SD Social Democratic Party | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 21 | Denmark | 2001 | SF Socialist People’s Party | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 22 | Denmark | 2001 | V Liberals | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 23 | Denmark | 2007 | DF Danish People’s Party | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 24 | Denmark | 2007 | EL Red-Green Unity List | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 25 | Denmark | 2007 | KF Conservative People’s Party | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 26 | Denmark | 2007 | NY New Alliance | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 1 | 0 | |
| 27 | Denmark | 2007 | RV Radical Party | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 28 | Denmark | 2007 | SD Social Democratic Party | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 29 | Denmark | 2007 | SF Socialist People’s Party | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 30 | Denmark | 2007 | V Liberals | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 31 | Denmark | 2011 | DF Danish People’s Party | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 32 | Denmark | 2011 | EL Red-Green Unity List | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 33 | Denmark | 2011 | KF Conservative People’s Party | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 34 | Denmark | 2011 | Liberal Alliance | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 1 | 0 | |
| 35 | Denmark | 2011 | RV Radical Party | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 36 | Denmark | 2011 | SD Social Democratic Party | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 37 | Denmark | 2011 | V Liberals | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 38 | Finland | 2003 | KD Christian Democrats in Finland | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 39 | Finland | 2003 | KK National Coalition | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 40 | Finland | 2003 | PS True Finns | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 41 | Finland | 2003 | RKP/SFP Swedish People’s Party | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 42 | Finland | 2003 | SK Finnish Centre | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 43 | Finland | 2003 | SSDP Finnish Social Democrats | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 44 | Finland | 2003 | VAS Left Wing Alliance | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 45 | Finland | 2003 | VL Green Union | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 46 | Finland | 2007 | KD Christian Democrats in Finland | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 47 | Finland | 2007 | KK National Coalition | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 48 | Finland | 2007 | PS True Finns | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 49 | Finland | 2007 | RKP/SFP Swedish People’s Party | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 50 | Finland | 2007 | SK Finnish Centre | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 51 | Finland | 2007 | SSDP Finnish Social Democrats | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 52 | Finland | 2007 | VAS Left Wing Alliance | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 53 | Finland | 2007 | VL Green Union | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 54 | Finland | 2011 | KD Christian Democrats in Finland | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 55 | Finland | 2011 | KK National Coalition | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 56 | Finland | 2011 | PS True Finns | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 57 | Finland | 2011 | RKP/SFP Swedish People’s Party | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 58 | Finland | 2011 | SK Finnish Centre | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 59 | Finland | 2011 | SSDP Finnish Social Democrats | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 60 | Finland | 2011 | VAS Left Wing Alliance | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 61 | Finland | 2011 | VL Green Union | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 62 | France | 2002 | FN National Front | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 63 | France | 2002 | Les Verts The Greens | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 64 | France | 2002 | PCF French Communist Party | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 65 | France | 2002 | PS Socialist Party | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 66 | France | 2002 | UDF Union for French Democracy | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 67 | France | 2002 | UMP Union for the Presidential Majority | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 68 | France | 2007 | FN National Front | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 69 | France | 2007 | Les Verts The Greens | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 70 | France | 2007 | MoDem Democratic Mouvement | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 71 | France | 2007 | PCF French Communist Party | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 72 | France | 2007 | PS Socialist Party | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 73 | France | 2007 | UMP Union for a Popular Movement | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 74 | France | 2012 | FDG Left Front | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 1 | 0 | |
| 75 | France | 2012 | FN National Front | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 76 | France | 2012 | Les Verts The Greens | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 77 | France | 2012 | NC New Centre | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 1 | 1 | |
| 78 | France | 2012 | PRG Left Radical Party | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 79 | France | 2012 | PS Socialist Party | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 80 | France | 2012 | UMP Union for a Popular Movement | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 81 | Germany | 2002 | 90/Greens Alliance‘90/Green | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 82 | Germany | 2002 | CDU/CSU Christian Democratic Union/Christian Social Union | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 83 | Germany | 2002 | FDP Free Democratic Party | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 84 | Germany | 2002 | PDS Party of Democratic Socialism | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 85 | Germany | 2002 | SPD Social Democratic Party of Germany | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 86 | Germany | 2005 | 90/Greens Alliance‘90/Green | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 87 | Germany | 2005 | CDU/CSU Christian Democratic Union/Christian Social Union | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 88 | Germany | 2005 | FDP Free Democratic Party | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 89 | Germany | 2005 | SPD Social Democratic Party of Germany | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 90 | Germany | 2009 | 90/Greens Alliance‘90/Green | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 91 | Germany | 2009 | CDU/CSU Christian Democratic Union/Christian Social Union | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 92 | Germany | 2009 | FDP Free Democratic Party | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 93 | Germany | 2009 | LINKE The Left | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 1 | 0 | |
| 94 | Germany | 2009 | SPD Social Democratic Party of Germany | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 95 | Germany | 2013 | 90/Greens Alliance‘90/Green | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 96 | Germany | 2013 | AfD Alternative for Germany | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 1 | 0 | |
| 97 | Germany | 2013 | CDU/CSU Christian Democratic Union/Christian Social Union | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 98 | Germany | 2013 | FDP Free Democratic Party | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 99 | Germany | 2013 | LINKE The Left | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 1 | 0 | |
| 100 | Germany | 2013 | Pirates | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 1 | 0 | |
| 101 | Germany | 2013 | SPD Social Democratic Party of Germany | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 102 | Great Britain | 2005 | Conservatives Conservative Party | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 103 | Great Britain | 2005 | Labour Labour Party | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 104 | Great Britain | 2005 | LibDems Liberal Democrats | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 105 | Great Britain | 2010 | Conservatives Conservative Party | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 106 | Great Britain | 2010 | Labour Labour Party | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 107 | Great Britain | 2010 | LibDems Liberal Democrats | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 108 | Iceland | 2003 | F Progressive Party | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 109 | Iceland | 2003 | FF Liberal Party | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 1 | 0 | |
| 110 | Iceland | 2003 | S The Alliance | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 1 | 0 | |
| 111 | Iceland | 2003 | Sj Independence Party | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 112 | Iceland | 2003 | VGF Left Green Movement | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 1 | 0 | |
| 113 | Iceland | 2007 | F Progressive Party | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 114 | Iceland | 2007 | FF Liberal Party | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 1 | 0 | |
| 115 | Iceland | 2007 | S The Alliance | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 1 | 0 | |
| 116 | Iceland | 2007 | Sj Independence Party | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 117 | Iceland | 2007 | VGF Left Green Movement | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 1 | 0 | |
| 118 | Iceland | 2009 | B Citizens' Movement | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 119 | Iceland | 2009 | F Progressive Party | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 120 | Iceland | 2009 | S The Alliance | current government | 1 | 0 | |
| 121 | Iceland | 2009 | Sj Independence Party | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 122 | Iceland | 2009 | VGF Left Green Movement | current government | 1 | 0 | |
| 123 | Ireland | 2002 | Familiy of the Irish | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 124 | Ireland | 2002 | Greens Green Party | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 125 | Ireland | 2002 | Labour Labour Party | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 126 | Ireland | 2002 | Ourselves Alone | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 127 | Ireland | 2002 | PD Progressive Democrats | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 128 | Ireland | 2002 | Soldiers of Destiny | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 129 | Ireland | 2007 | Familiy of the Irish | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 130 | Ireland | 2007 | Greens Green Party | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 131 | Ireland | 2007 | Labour Labour Party | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 132 | Ireland | 2007 | Ourselves Alone | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 133 | Ireland | 2007 | PD Progressive Democrats | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 134 | Ireland | 2007 | Soldiers of Destiny | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 135 | Ireland | 2011 | Familiy of the Irish | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 136 | Ireland | 2011 | Greens Green Party | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 137 | Ireland | 2011 | Labour Labour Party | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 138 | Ireland | 2011 | Ourselves Alone | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 139 | Ireland | 2011 | Soldiers of Destiny | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 140 | Italy | 2006 | AN National Alliance | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 141 | Italy | 2006 | FdV Green Federation | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 142 | Italy | 2006 | FI Go Italy | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 143 | Italy | 2006 | IdV List Di Pietro - Italy of Values | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 1 | 0 | |
| 144 | Italy | 2006 | LN Northern League | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 145 | Italy | 2006 | Olive Tree | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 146 | Italy | 2006 | PdCI Party of Italian Communists | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 1 | 0 | |
| 147 | Italy | 2006 | PRC Communist Refoundation Party | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 148 | Italy | 2006 | RnP Rose in the Fist | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 1 | 0 | |
| 149 | Italy | 2006 | UDC Union for Christian and Center Democrats | current government | 1 | 0 | |
| 150 | Italy | 2008 | IdV List Di Pietro - Italy of Values | current government | 1 | 0 | |
| 151 | Italy | 2008 | LN Northern League | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 152 | Italy | 2008 | PD Democratic Party | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 1 | 1 | |
| 153 | Italy | 2008 | PdL People of Freedom | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 1 | 1 | |
| 154 | Italy | 2008 | UdC Union of the Center | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 1 | 0 | |
| 155 | Italy | 2013 | CD Democratic Centre | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 1 | 0 | |
| 156 | Italy | 2013 | LN Northern League | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 157 | Italy | 2013 | M5S Five Star Movement | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 1 | 0 | |
| 158 | Italy | 2013 | PD Democratic Party | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 1 | 1 | |
| 159 | Italy | 2013 | PdL People of Freedom | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 1 | 1 | |
| 160 | Italy | 2013 | RC Civil Revolution | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 1 | 0 | |
| 161 | Italy | 2013 | SC Civic Choice | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 1 | 0 | |
| 162 | Italy | 2013 | SEL Left Ecology Freedom | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 1 | 0 | |
| 163 | Italy | 2013 | UdC Union of the Center | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 1 | 0 | |
| 164 | Netherlands | 2002 | CDA Christian Democratic Appeal | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 165 | Netherlands | 2002 | CU Christian Union | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 1 | 0 | |
| 166 | Netherlands | 2002 | D’66 Democrats‘ | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 167 | Netherlands | 2002 | GL Green Left | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 168 | Netherlands | 2002 | LN Livable Netherlands | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 1 | 0 | |
| 169 | Netherlands | 2002 | LPF List Pim Fortuyn | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 1 | 0 | |
| 170 | Netherlands | 2002 | PvdA Labour Party | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 171 | Netherlands | 2002 | SP Socialist Party | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 172 | Netherlands | 2002 | VVD People’s Party for Freedom and Democrac | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 173 | Netherlands | 2006 | CDA Christian Democratic Appeal | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 174 | Netherlands | 2006 | CU Christian Union | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 1 | 0 | |
| 175 | Netherlands | 2006 | D’66 Democrats‘ | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 176 | Netherlands | 2006 | GL Green Left | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 177 | Netherlands | 2006 | PvdA Labour Party | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 178 | Netherlands | 2006 | PvdD Party for the Animals | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 1 | 0 | |
| 179 | Netherlands | 2006 | PVV Party of Freedom | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 1 | 0 | |
| 180 | Netherlands | 2006 | SGP Reformed Political Party | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 181 | Netherlands | 2006 | SP Socialist Party | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 182 | Netherlands | 2006 | VVD People’s Party for Freedom and Democrac | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 183 | Netherlands | 2010 | CDA Christian Democratic Appeal | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 184 | Netherlands | 2010 | CU Christian Union | current government | 1 | 0 | |
| 185 | Netherlands | 2010 | D’66 Democrats‘ | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 186 | Netherlands | 2010 | GL Green Left | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 187 | Netherlands | 2010 | PvdA Labour Party | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 188 | Netherlands | 2010 | PvdD Party for the Animals | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 1 | 0 | |
| 189 | Netherlands | 2010 | PVV Party of Freedom | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 1 | 0 | |
| 190 | Netherlands | 2010 | SGP Reformed Political Party | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 191 | Netherlands | 2010 | SP Socialist Party | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 192 | Netherlands | 2010 | VVD People’s Party for Freedom and Democrac | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 193 | Norway | 2001 | DnA Norwegian Labour Party | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 194 | Norway | 2001 | FrP Progress Party | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 195 | Norway | 2001 | H Conservative Party | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 196 | Norway | 2001 | KrF Christian People’s Party | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 197 | Norway | 2001 | Sp Centre Party | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 198 | Norway | 2001 | SV Socialist Left Party | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 199 | Norway | 2001 | V Liberal Party | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 200 | Norway | 2005 | DnA Norwegian Labour Party | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 201 | Norway | 2005 | FrP Progress Party | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 202 | Norway | 2005 | H Conservative Party | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 203 | Norway | 2005 | KrF Christian People’s Party | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 204 | Norway | 2005 | Sp Centre Party | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 205 | Norway | 2005 | SV Socialist Left Party | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 206 | Norway | 2005 | V Liberal Party | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 207 | Norway | 2009 | DnA Norwegian Labour Party | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 208 | Norway | 2009 | FrP Progress Party | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 209 | Norway | 2009 | H Conservative Party | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 210 | Norway | 2009 | KrF Christian People’s Party | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 211 | Norway | 2009 | Sp Centre Party | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 212 | Norway | 2009 | SV Socialist Left Party | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 213 | Norway | 2009 | V Liberal Party | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 214 | Portugal | 2002 | BE Left Bloc | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 1 | 0 | |
| 215 | Portugal | 2002 | CDS-PP Social Democratic Center-Popular Party | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 216 | Portugal | 2002 | CDU Unified Democratic Coalition | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 217 | Portugal | 2002 | PS Socialist Party | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 218 | Portugal | 2002 | PSD Social Democratic Party | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 219 | Portugal | 2005 | BE Left Bloc | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 1 | 0 | |
| 220 | Portugal | 2005 | CDS-PP Social Democratic Center-Popular Party | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 221 | Portugal | 2005 | CDU Unified Democratic Coalition | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 222 | Portugal | 2005 | PS Socialist Party | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 223 | Portugal | 2005 | PSD Social Democratic Party | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 224 | Portugal | 2009 | BE Left Bloc | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 1 | 0 | |
| 225 | Portugal | 2009 | CDS-PP Social Democratic Center-Popular Party | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 226 | Portugal | 2009 | PS Socialist Party | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 227 | Portugal | 2009 | PSD Social Democratic Party | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 228 | Spain | 2004 | CC Canarian Coalition | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 229 | Spain | 2004 | CiU Convergence and Union | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 230 | Spain | 2004 | ERC Catalan Republican Left | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 231 | Spain | 2004 | IU United Left | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 232 | Spain | 2004 | PNV/EAJ Basque Nationalist Party | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 233 | Spain | 2004 | PP Popular Party | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 234 | Spain | 2004 | PSOE Spanish Socialist Workers’ Party | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 235 | Spain | 2008 | CiU Convergence and Union | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 236 | Spain | 2008 | ERC Catalan Republican Left | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 237 | Spain | 2008 | IU United Left | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 238 | Spain | 2008 | PNV/EAJ Basque Nationalist Party | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 239 | Spain | 2008 | PP Popular Party | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 240 | Spain | 2008 | PSOE Spanish Socialist Workers’ Party | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 241 | Spain | 2011 | Amaiur | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 1 | 0 | |
| 242 | Spain | 2011 | CC Canarian Coalition | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 243 | Spain | 2011 | CiU Convergence and Union | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 244 | Spain | 2011 | ERC Catalan Republican Left | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 245 | Spain | 2011 | Future Yes | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 1 | 0 | |
| 246 | Spain | 2011 | IU United Left | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 247 | Spain | 2011 | PNV/EAJ Basque Nationalist Party | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 248 | Spain | 2011 | PP Popular Party | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 249 | Spain | 2011 | PSOE Spanish Socialist Workers’ Party | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 250 | Spain | 2011 | UPyD Union, Progress and Democracy | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 1 | 0 | |
| 251 | Sweden | 2002 | CP Centre Party | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 252 | Sweden | 2002 | FP Liberal People’s Party | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 253 | Sweden | 2002 | Kd Christian Democrats | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 254 | Sweden | 2002 | MP Green Ecology Party | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 255 | Sweden | 2002 | MSP Moderate Coalition Party | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 256 | Sweden | 2002 | SAP Social Democratic Labour Party | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 257 | Sweden | 2002 | V Left Party | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 258 | Sweden | 2006 | CP Centre Party | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 259 | Sweden | 2006 | FP Liberal People’s Party | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 260 | Sweden | 2006 | Kd Christian Democrats | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 261 | Sweden | 2006 | MP Green Ecology Party | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 262 | Sweden | 2006 | MSP Moderate Coalition Party | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 263 | Sweden | 2006 | SAP Social Democratic Labour Party | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 264 | Sweden | 2006 | V Left Party | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 265 | Sweden | 2010 | CP Centre Party | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 266 | Sweden | 2010 | FP Liberal People’s Party | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 267 | Sweden | 2010 | Kd Christian Democrats | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 268 | Sweden | 2010 | MP Green Ecology Party | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 269 | Sweden | 2010 | MSP Moderate Coalition Party | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 270 | Sweden | 2010 | SAP Social Democratic Labour Party | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 271 | Sweden | 2010 | SD Sweden Democrats | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 272 | Sweden | 2010 | V Left Party | opposition,little/no gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 273 | United States | 2004 | Democrats Democratic Party | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 274 | United States | 2004 | Republicans Republican Party | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 275 | United States | 2008 | Democrats Democratic Party | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |
| 276 | United States | 2008 | Republicans Republican Party | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 277 | United States | 2012 | Democrats Democratic Party | current government | 0 | 0 | |
| 278 | United States | 2012 | Republicans Republican Party | opposition,gov. exp. | 0 | 0 | |

# Appendix C: Figures

*Figure C1: Salience of economic issues based on Chapel Hill expert survey*



*Note: The figure shows mean salience of the following categories: ‘importance/salience of improving public services vs. reducing taxes’, ‘importance/salience of deregulation’, and ‘importance/salience of redistribution’ per country/year. Bakker, Ryan et al. (2012). Measuring Party Positions in Europe: The Chapel Hill Expert Survey Trend File, 1999-2010.* Party Politics, *21(1), 143-152.*

*Figure C2: Salience of different issues*

a) Voters

**

b) Parties

**

*Figure C3: Average salience of pro-market, pro-state and general economic issues before and during the economic crisis for left and right government and opposition Parties*

**

*Note: Parties are coded as ‘left’ if their ideological position as measured by the RILE –index is below the sample average (-6) and ‘right’ if the position is above.*

# Appendix D: Robustness Tests

*Table D1: Determinants of issue salience congruence, including social policy*

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | **Model 1** | **Model 2** | **Model 3** | **Model 4** |
| Intercept | -31.57\*\*\* | -23.21\*\*\* | -31.38\*\*\* | -20.38\*\*\* |
|  | (4.85) | (3.72) | (4.20) | (4.03) |
| Opposition, with gov. experience | -2.86 | -3.51 | -2.73 | -5.15 |
|  | (2.15) | (2.32) | (2.90) | (3.14) |
| Opposition, little/no gov. exp. | -3.28 | -2.62 | -7.39\* | -2.98 |
|  | (2.49) | (2.82) | (2.97) | (3.33) |
| Unemployment | -3.18\* | -4.25 |  |  |
|  | (1.58) | (2.61) |  |  |
| GDP growth | 5.11\*\*\* |  | 4.42\*\*\* |  |
|  | (0.77) |  | (1.00) |  |
| Crisis | -1.38 |  |  | -10.29\* |
|  | (4.98) |  |  | (4.86) |
| Vote share | -0.01 | -0.02 | -0.00 | 0.01 |
|  | (0.09) | (0.10) | (0.09) | (0.10) |
| Niche party | 1.86 | 3.01 | 1.19 | 3.64 |
|  | (2.61) | (2.92) | (2.52) | (2.92) |
| Opposition, gov. exp. x Unemployment |  | 1.70 |  |  |
|  |  | (3.47) |  |  |
| Opposition, little/no gov. exp. x Unemployment |  | -7.74\* |  |  |
|  |  | (3.07) |  |  |
| Opposition, gov. exp. x GDP growth |  |  | -0.15 |  |
|  |  |  | (1.17) |  |
| Opposition, little/no gov. exp. x GDP growth |  |  | 2.45\* |  |
|  |  |  | (1.09) |  |
| Opposition, gov. exp. x Crisis |  |  |  | 4.71 |
|  |  |  |  | (5.17) |
| Opposition, little/no gov. exp. x Crisis |  |  |  | -7.55 |
|  |  |  |  | (4.57) |
| AIC | 2290.03 | 2317.17 | 2290.19 | 2329.77 |
| BIC | 2329.94 | 2357.08 | 2330.09 | 2369.67 |
| Log Likelihood | -1134.02 | -1147.59 | -1134.09 | -1153.88 |
| Num. obs. | 278 | 278 | 278 | 278 |
| Num. groups: Party | 115 | 115 | 115 | 115 |
| Num. groups: Election year | 13 | 13 | 13 | 13 |
| Var: Party (Intercept) | 54.63 | 82.93 | 43.65 | 69.80 |
| Var: Election year (Intercept) | 132.20 | 70.05 | 114.41 | 47.20 |
| Var: Residual | 156.20 | 166.91 | 161.82 | 191.64 |
| \*\*\*p < 0.001, \*\*p < 0.01, \*p < 0.05 | | | | | |

*Note: The dependent variable ‘issue salience congruence’ calculates the absolute difference between parties’ attention to economic and social issues and the share of the voters (of each party) who named the either social policy or the economy as the most important issue.*

*Table D2: Determinants of issue salience congruence, general economic category only*

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | **Model 1** | **Model 2** | **Model 3** | **Model 4** |
| Intercept | -44.18\*\*\* | -31.05\*\*\* | -45.60\*\*\* | -30.90\*\*\* |
|  | (6.58) | (5.29) | (5.90) | (6.16) |
| Opposition, with gov. experience | -1.69 | -2.19 | -4.19 | -1.60 |
|  | (2.55) | (2.97) | (3.74) | (4.31) |
| Opposition, little/no gov. exp. | 2.06 | 1.86 | -5.37 | 4.12 |
|  | (2.72) | (3.39) | (3.65) | (4.32) |
| Unemployment | -12.81\*\*\* | -14.16\*\*\* |  |  |
|  | (1.77) | (3.30) |  |  |
| GDP growth | 8.18\*\*\* |  | 7.67\*\*\* |  |
|  | (0.86) |  | (1.25) |  |
| Crisis | -1.18 |  |  | -7.98 |
|  | (6.45) |  |  | (7.74) |
| Vote share | -0.10 | -0.09 | -0.12 | -0.08 |
|  | (0.09) | (0.12) | (0.10) | (0.12) |
| Niche party | 1.52 | 3.05 | 1.07 | 4.27 |
|  | (2.65) | (3.32) | (2.83) | (3.46) |
| Opposition, gov. exp. x Unemployment |  | -2.09 |  |  |
|  |  | (4.35) |  |  |
| Opposition, little/no gov. exp. x Unemployment |  | -7.87\* |  |  |
|  |  | (3.85) |  |  |
| Opposition, gov. exp. x GDP growth |  |  | 1.64 |  |
|  |  |  | (1.45) |  |
| Opposition, little/no gov. exp. x GDP growth |  |  | 3.34\* |  |
|  |  |  | (1.34) |  |
| Opposition, gov. exp. x Crisis |  |  |  | -1.09 |
|  |  |  |  | (6.97) |
| Opposition, little/no gov. exp. x Crisis |  |  |  | -18.35\*\* |
|  |  |  |  | (6.30) |
| AIC | 2369.19 | 2439.24 | 2414.56 | 2495.90 |
| BIC | 2409.10 | 2479.15 | 2454.47 | 2535.80 |
| Log Likelihood | -1173.60 | -1208.62 | -1196.28 | -1236.95 |
| Num. obs. | 278 | 278 | 278 | 278 |
| Num. groups: Party | 115 | 115 | 115 | 115 |
| Num. groups: Election year | 13 | 13 | 13 | 13 |
| Var: Party (Intercept) | 22.73 | 73.03 | 16.85 | 37.88 |
| Var: Election year (Intercept) | 335.00 | 209.01 | 282.13 | 191.08 |
| Var: Residual | 239.66 | 289.38 | 291.89 | 408.97 |
| \*\*\*p < 0.001, \*\*p < 0.01, \*p < 0.05 | | | | | |

*Note: The dependent variable ‘issue salience congruence’ calculates the absolute difference between parties’ mention of ‘general economic issues’ (per408) and the share of the voters (of each party) for whom the economy was the most important issue.*

*Table D3: Determinants of issue salience congruence; different specification of opposition parties (not time variant): parties that have joined government at least once between 1979 and the latest election in the dataset are coded as office-seeking*

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | **Model 1** | **Model 2** | **Model 3** | **Model 4** |
| Intercept | -26.32\*\*\* | -16.93\*\*\* | -27.26\*\*\* | -17.48\*\*\* |
|  | (4.98) | (3.67) | (4.36) | (4.15) |
| Opposition, with gov. experience | -2.06 | -2.01 | -4.66 | -1.17 |
|  | (1.98) | (2.12) | (2.94) | (3.16) |
| Opposition, little/no gov. exp. | -3.74 | -3.28 | -9.72\*\* | -2.68 |
|  | (2.39) | (2.85) | (3.18) | (3.89) |
| Unemployment | -11.37\*\*\* | -10.22\*\*\* |  |  |
|  | (1.45) | (2.51) |  |  |
| GDP growth | 5.19\*\*\* |  | 4.93\*\*\* |  |
|  | (0.71) |  | (1.04) |  |
| Crisis | 1.45 |  |  | -5.97 |
|  | (5.11) |  |  | (5.16) |
| Vote share | -0.06 | -0.07 | -0.05 | -0.03 |
|  | (0.07) | (0.09) | (0.08) | (0.10) |
| Niche party | 2.42 | 3.55 | 1.83 | 4.70 |
|  | (2.22) | (2.63) | (2.45) | (3.05) |
| Opposition, gov. exp. x Unemployment |  | -2.10 |  |  |
|  |  | (3.04) |  |  |
| Opposition, little/no gov. exp. x Unemployment |  | -10.60\*\*\* |  |  |
|  |  | (3.08) |  |  |
| Opposition, gov. exp. x GDP growth |  |  | 1.28 |  |
|  |  |  | (1.13) |  |
| Opposition, little/no gov. exp. x GDP growth |  |  | 3.24\*\* |  |
|  |  |  | (1.21) |  |
| Opposition, gov. exp. x Crisis |  |  |  | -3.88 |
|  |  |  |  | (5.28) |
| Opposition, little/no gov. exp. x Crisis |  |  |  | -13.20\* |
|  |  |  |  | (5.21) |
| AIC | 2264.20 | 2291.20 | 2316.05 | 2369.67 |
| BIC | 2304.10 | 2331.11 | 2355.96 | 2409.57 |
| Log Likelihood | -1121.10 | -1134.60 | -1147.03 | -1173.83 |
| Num. obs. | 278 | 278 | 278 | 278 |
| Num. groups: Party | 115 | 115 | 115 | 115 |
| Num. groups: Election year | 13 | 13 | 13 | 13 |
| Var: Party (Intercept) | 13.76 | 47.85 | 15.08 | 58.38 |
| Var: Election year (Intercept) | 175.55 | 87.86 | 131.65 | 49.25 |
| Var: Residual | 165.74 | 165.83 | 203.22 | 238.12 |
| \*\*\*p < 0.001, \*\*p < 0.01, \*p < 0.05 | | | | | |

*Table D4: Determinants of issue salience congruence, excluding new parties that are mergers of established parties with previous government experience*

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | **Model 1** | **Model 2** | **Model 3** | **Model 4** |
| Intercept | -25.19\*\*\* | -16.71\*\*\* | -25.73\*\*\* | -16.40\*\*\* |
|  | (4.94) | (3.56) | (4.22) | (4.05) |
| Opposition, with gov. experience | -1.91 | -2.05 | -3.09 | -2.27 |
|  | (2.10) | (2.25) | (3.12) | (3.34) |
| Opposition, little/no gov. exp. | -2.20 | -0.52 | -9.20\*\* | -0.94 |
|  | (2.28) | (2.62) | (3.15) | (3.50) |
| Unemployment | -11.67\*\*\* | -9.80\*\*\* |  |  |
|  | (1.50) | (2.50) |  |  |
| GDP growth | 4.88\*\*\* |  | 4.56\*\*\* |  |
|  | (0.71) |  | (1.03) |  |
| Crisis | 0.92 |  |  | -6.96 |
|  | (5.32) |  |  | (5.10) |
| Vote share | -0.07 | -0.08 | -0.11 | -0.06 |
|  | (0.08) | (0.09) | (0.09) | (0.10) |
| Niche party | 1.30 | 1.99 | 1.36 | 3.67 |
|  | (2.16) | (2.48) | (2.38) | (2.90) |
| Opposition, gov. exp. x Unemployment |  | -1.25 |  |  |
|  |  | (3.28) |  |  |
| Opposition, little/no gov. exp. x Unemployment |  | -10.25\*\*\* |  |  |
|  |  | (2.93) |  |  |
| Opposition, gov. exp. x GDP growth |  |  | 0.99 |  |
|  |  |  | (1.21) |  |
| Opposition, little/no gov. exp. x GDP growth |  |  | 2.77\* |  |
|  |  |  | (1.14) |  |
| Opposition, gov. exp. x Crisis |  |  |  | 1.42 |
|  |  |  |  | (5.51) |
| Opposition, little/no gov. exp. x Crisis |  |  |  | -13.72\*\* |
|  |  |  |  | (5.00) |
| AIC | 2167.15 | 2189.16 | 2218.84 | 2260.21 |
| BIC | 2206.60 | 2228.62 | 2258.30 | 2299.67 |
| Log Likelihood | -1072.57 | -1083.58 | -1098.42 | -1119.10 |
| Num. obs. | 267 | 267 | 267 | 267 |
| Num. groups: Party | 109 | 109 | 109 | 109 |
| Num. groups: Election year | 13 | 13 | 13 | 13 |
| Var: Party (Intercept) | 11.09 | 34.26 | 10.43 | 44.24 |
| Var: Election year (Intercept) | 166.85 | 77.56 | 113.41 | 44.10 |
| Var: Residual | 163.05 | 167.75 | 203.73 | 233.10 |
| \*\*\*p < 0.001, \*\*p < 0.01, \*p < 0.05 | | | | | |

*Table D5: Determinants of issue salience congruence, excluding new parties that are mainstream right or left or center*

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | **Model 1** | **Model 2** | **Model 3** | **Model 4** |
| Intercept | -25.04\*\*\* | -15.86\*\*\* | -25.75\*\*\* | -14.89\*\*\* |
|  | (5.27) | (3.73) | (4.51) | (4.29) |
| Opposition, with gov. experience | -1.77 | -2.22 | -3.67 | -2.42 |
|  | (2.15) | (2.33) | (3.19) | (3.45) |
| Opposition, little/no gov. exp. | -3.10 | -2.35 | -10.14\*\* | -1.92 |
|  | (2.46) | (2.86) | (3.37) | (3.84) |
| Unemployment | -11.60\*\*\* | -10.11\*\*\* |  |  |
|  | (1.59) | (2.80) |  |  |
| GDP growth | 5.19\*\*\* |  | 4.68\*\*\* |  |
|  | (0.76) |  | (1.07) |  |
| Crisis | -0.55 |  |  | -7.46 |
|  | (5.61) |  |  | (5.27) |
| Vote share | -0.08 | -0.11 | -0.10 | -0.09 |
|  | (0.08) | (0.10) | (0.09) | (0.11) |
| Niche party | 1.82 | 2.55 | 0.94 | 2.33 |
|  | (2.30) | (2.69) | (2.58) | (3.11) |
| Opposition, gov. exp. x Unemployment |  | -1.05 |  |  |
|  |  | (3.54) |  |  |
| Opposition, little/no gov. exp. x Unemployment |  | -9.81\*\* |  |  |
|  |  | (3.24) |  |  |
| Opposition, gov. exp. x GDP growth |  |  | 1.22 |  |
|  |  |  | (1.24) |  |
| Opposition, little/no gov. exp. x GDP growth |  |  | 3.43\*\* |  |
|  |  |  | (1.21) |  |
| Opposition, gov. exp. x Crisis |  |  |  | 1.07 |
|  |  |  |  | (5.71) |
| Opposition, little/no gov. exp. x Crisis |  |  |  | -10.85\* |
|  |  |  |  | (5.27) |
| AIC | 2043.03 | 2068.79 | 2086.81 | 2132.74 |
| BIC | 2081.81 | 2107.57 | 2125.59 | 2171.52 |
| Log Likelihood | -1010.52 | -1023.39 | -1032.40 | -1055.37 |
| Num. obs. | 251 | 251 | 251 | 251 |
| Num. groups: Party | 101 | 101 | 101 | 101 |
| Num. groups: Election year | 13 | 13 | 13 | 13 |
| Var: Party (Intercept) | 14.10 | 40.22 | 21.63 | 50.16 |
| Var: Election year (Intercept) | 173.34 | 77.88 | 123.74 | 44.02 |
| Var: Residual | 163.98 | 172.71 | 193.67 | 238.78 |
| \*\*\*p < 0.001, \*\*p < 0.01, \*p < 0.05 | | | | | |

*Note: The parties were coded as mainstream left, right or center if they belong to one of the following party families (as coded in the CMP dataset): Social democratic parties, Liberal Parties, Christian Democratic Parties, Conservative Parties, or* *Agrarian Parties.*

*Table D6: Determinants of issue salience congruence, excluding new parties without government experience that are mainstream right or left or center*

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | **Model 1** | **Model 2** | **Model 3** | **Model 4** |
| Intercept | -25.38\*\*\* | -17.24\*\*\* | -25.77\*\*\* | -15.72\*\*\* |
|  | (5.20) | (3.72) | (4.43) | (4.32) |
| Opposition, with gov. experience | -1.87 | -1.96 | -3.41 | -2.06 |
|  | (2.10) | (2.26) | (3.11) | (3.37) |
| Opposition, little/no gov. exp. | -2.56 | -1.32 | -9.65\*\* | -1.49 |
|  | (2.65) | (3.12) | (3.48) | (4.09) |
| Unemployment | -11.50\*\*\* | -9.88\*\*\* |  |  |
|  | (1.57) | (2.54) |  |  |
| GDP growth | 5.08\*\*\* |  | 4.77\*\*\* |  |
|  | (0.76) |  | (1.05) |  |
| Crisis | -0.35 |  |  | -6.72 |
|  | (5.61) |  |  | (5.30) |
| Vote share | -0.05 | -0.05 | -0.09 | -0.07 |
|  | (0.08) | (0.10) | (0.09) | (0.11) |
| Niche party | 1.56 | 2.81 | 0.79 | 3.19 |
|  | (2.45) | (2.87) | (2.75) | (3.30) |
| Opposition, gov. exp. x Unemployment |  | -1.71 |  |  |
|  |  | (3.33) |  |  |
| Opposition, little/no gov. exp. x Unemployment |  | -10.73\*\*\* |  |  |
|  |  | (3.14) |  |  |
| Opposition, gov. exp. x GDP growth |  |  | 0.98 |  |
|  |  |  | (1.22) |  |
| Opposition, little/no gov. exp. x GDP growth |  |  | 3.03\* |  |
|  |  |  | (1.24) |  |
| Opposition, gov. exp. x Crisis |  |  |  | 0.17 |
|  |  |  |  | (5.51) |
| Opposition, little/no gov. exp. x Crisis |  |  |  | -13.67\* |
|  |  |  |  | (5.31) |
| AIC | 1953.05 | 1975.09 | 1998.40 | 2035.80 |
| BIC | 1991.34 | 2013.37 | 2036.69 | 2074.08 |
| Log Likelihood | -965.52 | -976.54 | -988.20 | -1006.90 |
| Num. obs. | 240 | 240 | 240 | 240 |
| Num. groups: Party | 101 | 101 | 101 | 101 |
| Num. groups: Election year | 13 | 13 | 13 | 13 |
| Var: Party (Intercept) | 14.12 | 44.69 | 19.79 | 53.99 |
| Var: Election year (Intercept) | 178.97 | 81.99 | 126.38 | 55.25 |
| Var: Residual | 162.83 | 166.06 | 197.46 | 229.89 |
| \*\*\*p < 0.001, \*\*p < 0.01, \*p < 0.05 | | | | | |

*Note: The parties were coded as mainstream left, right or center if they belong to one of the following party families (as coded in the CMP dataset): Social democratic parties, Liberal Parties, Christian Democratic Parties, Conservative Parties,* or *Agrarian Parties.*